

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEAL  
For the Fifth Circuit

---

No. 98-10324

---

UNION PACIFIC RESOURCES GROUP INC., ET AL

Plaintiffs,

VERSUS

PENNZOIL COMPANY,

Defendant-Appellant-Cross-Appellee,

VERSUS

FORT WORTH STAR TELEGRAM,

Movant-Appellee-Cross-Appellant.

---

Appeals from the United States District Court  
For the Northern District of Texas  
(4:97-CV-509)

---

June 9, 1998

Before DUHÉ, BENAVIDES, and STEWART, Circuit Judges.

PER CURIAM:<sup>1</sup>

On the facts of this case, even if the public has a right to know the contents of the transcript of the closed hearing, that right does not outweigh Pennzoil's right to privacy of its

---

<sup>1</sup>Pursuant to 5TH CIR. R. 47.5, the Court has determined that this opinion should not be published and is not precedent except under the limited circumstances set forth in 5TH CIR. R. 47.5.4.

confidential business plan. Therefore, it was an abuse of discretion for the district court not to make the additional redactions asked for by Pennzoil. Accordingly, the judgment of the district court ordering the release of the redacted transcript is vacated, the case is remanded to the district court with instructions that it make the additional redactions to the transcript requested by Pennzoil and then order the release of the redacted transcript.

JUDGMENT VACATED AND CASE REMANDED WITH INSTRUCTIONS.